

# **ARH 171**

# Who Owns the Past? Cultural Heritage and Modern Politics

Instructor Dr. Erin Walcek Averett

Office LECA 114

Contact erinaverett@creighton.edu
Lecture TR 11:00 – 12:15, LECA 104
Office Hours T 10-11, and by appointment

## **Course Description**

The course explores the dynamic issues surrounding the manipulation of culture with a focus on the destruction, manipulation, and theft of archaeological and artistic cultural monuments from antiquity to today. The way the past is studied, interpreted, presented, and conserved is becoming an increasingly hot topic in today's politicized global environment, in which the past is often manipulated in nation-building, international alliances, and cultural agendas. Recent controversies over the provenance and ownership of some art objects – primarily, but not exclusively, antiquities – have brought the problem of how the art world engages with cultural heritage to the fore. Topics covered include looting, vandalism, iconoclasm, forgery, theft, smuggling, and destruction of art objects and cultural heritage sites.

In the course, you will examine the scholarly and public debates about cultural heritage at a selection of the world's greatest sites and through study of selected monuments. We will investigate a series of questions, including but not limited to:

- 1. What is cultural heritage and why does it matter? Who Owns the Past?
- 2. Why preserve the past, and in what form? Why do the living have responsibilities to ancient peoples?
- 3. How has past cultural heritage been used and abused for political purposes in different historical and cultural contexts around the world? How can archaeology and art history contribute to understanding the processing of colonization and globalization that produced the modern world?
- 4. How do museums, collections, restitution of cultural property, and the illicit traffic in artifacts contribute to this situation?
- 5. What solutions have been tried or proposed to mitigate the ongoing struggle for control of the past and cultural heritage?

6. What does an interest in preserving heritage say about our own culture, and what we are "preserving" when we claim to do so?

#### Fit to Core and Mission

This is a Foundations Tier course and fulfills the Critical Issues in Human Inquiry component in the First-Year Experience. The course emphasizes critical thinking, written and oral communication, and engagement with diversity and social justice. Conceptions of ethical choice, social justice, and human dignity will be framed in the Jesuit and Catholic tradition, and explored through an examination of contentious elements in the exploitation and interpretation of past artistic monuments to further contemporary political and social agendas throughout time and across the globe. Students will compose critical or creative works that embody or analyze artistic forms, and students will explore values and ethical perspectives in humanistic, aesthetic, religious, and philosophical concepts. Through introductions to the history of the discipline and methods of art history and archaeology and examination of case studies in class, presentations, and research papers, students will be exposed to the positive and negative impact of the use and abuse of past cultural heritage in contemporary society. Students will be continually challenged to consider their own perspectives on the causes and remedies of the impact and repercussion of the manipulation of past artistic monuments.

Art History classes are vehicles for delivering the learning outcomes prescribed by this component, including information literacy, research and writing, acknowledgement of personal and cultural biases, and various global identities in the past and present. This course based in art historical and archaeological inquiry is dedicated to Creighton's pursuit of instruction in ethics and social justice by examining the ethics of decisions that determine preservation, interpretation, and dissemination of the past and cultural heritage. Through attempting to define the problematic term "cultural heritage" students we think critically about this contentious issue and its impact on cultures around the world. In head-on discussions, students will consider how modern political ideologies such as colonialism and nationalism, wars, poverty, and a thriving illicit antiquities market are closely intertwined with how past cultural heritage is collected, interpreted, presented, and maintained.

## **Course Objectives**

Students who successfully complete this course will have demonstrated the ability to:

- 1. Develop the basic skills of information literacy, including searching for information, critically evaluating information from sources, and appropriately using and citing information related to archaeology, art history, and cultural heritage studies (Critical Issues in Human Inquiry Objective 2.I.I)
- 2. Demonstrate self-knowledge, including knowledge of their own biases and perspectives, and be able to evaluate the strengths and weaknesses of varying points of view in studying how cultural heritage has been across the globe (Critical Issues in Human Inquiry Objective 2.R.I)
- 3. Explain how the concepts of "service" and "social justice," as they are understood within the Catholic and Jesuit traditions, relate to the study, interpretation, and treatment of cultural heritage. (Critical Issues in Human Inquiry Objective 3E.I.I)
- 4. Explain how Art History, Archaeology, and Cultural Heritage studies identify social ideals and analyze actual societal conditions in terms of social justice. (Critical Issues in Human Inquiry Objective 3E.R.2)
- 5. Describe the range and types of human identities and cultures in contemporary or historical terms and identify what constitutes "difference" (or what has constituted "difference") within the United States and throughout the global community. (Critical Issues in Human Inquiry Objective 6.1.1)
- 6. State the meaning of "human dignity" as articulated within the Catholic, Jesuit, and other intellectual traditions and how "human dignity" is influenced by systems of social differentiation and by relative power and privilege. (Critical Issues in Human Inquiry Objective 6.I.2)
- 7. Identify their own social locations and analyze a controversial issue by articulating their own values and perspectives and those of an unfamiliar community. (Critical Issues in Human Inquiry Objective 6.R.I)

8. Evaluate and critique ideologies of social differentiation and the way systems of relative power and privilege are (or have been) reinforced through the interpretation, collection, adaption, destruction, and conservation of cultural heritage. (Critical Issues in Human Inquiry Objective 6.R.2)

Assessment of these objectives will be based on participation and discussion, exams, and a research project that includes an oral and written component.

## **Course Materials**

## **Required Textbooks:**

Waxman, S. 2009. Loot: The Battle over the Stolen Treasures of the Ancient World. Times Books. Charney, N. 2009. Art and Crime: Exploring the Dark Side of the Art World. Praeger.

#### **Recommended Textbooks:**

Hacker, D. 2011. A Pocket Style Manual. 6<sup>th</sup> edition. Bedford/St. Martin's. (earlier or used recent editions will be fine). This will be a great reference for your college career, not just this class!

#### BlueLine and CU mail:

I will post course material, readings, & announcements on BlueLine & CU mail. You are expected to check BlueLine regularly and download course materials.





Like Art History at Creighton (or follow ArtHistory@Creighton on Twitter) for art history and archaeology news and updates!

# **Course Requirements & Grading**

Your grade for the course will be determined based on the following assignments (all must be completed to pass):

	Participation & Discussion	15%
I5 Feb	Exam I	20%
12 Apr	Exam II	20%
	Research Project:	
TBD	Research Presentation	10%
26 Apr	Research Paper	20%
I May	Take-Home Final Exam	15%

#### **E**xams

There are three exams in this class. The first two exams will cover material covered in your readings, lecture, and discussion and will consist of short answer and essay questions. The final exam consists of a take-home reflective essay on what you have learned throughout the semester from class lecture, discussion, readings, and student presentations. The essay will invite you to consider the broader ethical and social justice themes covered throughout the course by using specific examples.

#### Research Project: Presentation & Paper

Each student will choose a topic to research for this project. The topic can be a more in-depth study of a topic covered in class or the application of the approaches used in class to other global cultures or subjects. This research project consists of individual research on an approved topic, a prospectus, a 7-minute presentation followed by discussion, and a final written academic paper (8-10 pages). The project will be graded based on the quality of research; the strength of the argument and evidence presented; the quality, clarity, and format of the presentation; and quality of writing and proper format for the paper. An extensive Research and Writing Guidelines booklet will be provided and students are encouraged to meet individually with me for guidance throughout the project. The presentation component will be worth 10% of your final grade and the final paper will be worth 20%.

The project will be completed in 5 phases:

## I. Choose your topic (15 Feb)

I will hand out a list of possible research topics, but do not feel limited to these. A good topic is one that will not simply review or summarize others' works, but puts forth an original idea, argument, or view of the historical evidence. I encourage you to choose a topic related to what we covered in class. I will not grade this portion of the project, but will approve/reject topics and provide feedback. NB: your topic must be approved before you continue research. Earlier submissions are encouraged!

## 2. Prospectus & Presentation of Topic (15 Mar)

This includes submission of a working title; a 200-word abstract outlining your topic, your thesis, the evidence you will be using to prove your thesis, and your approach as well as tentative conclusions; a working outline; and a working bibliography for your paper. I will provide feedback that should be incorporated into your final presentation, paper, and bibliography. Additionally, this day in class each student will give a 2-minute presentation of their topic and approach to the class.

## 3. In-Class Writing Workshop (5 Apr)

Each student will bring a printed copy of the complete paper draft (I realize at this point your conclusion might be weak – that's ok!). You will be assigned a writing partner in class and we will go through the basics of the revisions process in a guided exercise. You will continue to edit and revise your partner's paper, emailing it to them and me and your partner by the due date. If you are reading this carefully, you can email me a cute animal pic for 2 pts extra credit on your first exam.

#### 4. In-Class Presentation (TBA)

Each student will be assigned a presentation day. You should prepare a well-organized visual presentation that informs the class of your topic, your approach, argument, your evidence, and conclusions. The presentation should be 7 minutes with time for questions afterwards. All images should be of high quality and properly labeled (title, date, findspot or location, period or culture, etc.). Students will evaluate each other's presentations.

## 5. Final Paper (26 Apr)

A final paper will be due at the end of the semester. The papers should be 8-10 pages, with additional pages for bibliography and illustrations. Papers should be properly illustrated and cited with a formatted bibliography in the style provided on the handout.

## **Participation & Discussion**

Attendance is crucial in order to perform well in this class. Absence does not relieve you of your responsibility for material covered in discussion. If you must miss class, you are responsible for obtaining all notes and relevant materials. To make the course enjoyable and interesting, all students are also expected to participate actively. In other words, it is not enough to just show up! You should come to class with your readings (and notes) completed, ready to participate in discussions. You will be graded based the quality of your **active participation** in class. If students do not consistently come to class prepared to discuss the readings, quizzes will be given. Three or more

unexcused absences will result in an F for the course. Distracting use of cell phones, tablets, and laptops will negatively impact your participation grade. You will be given a preliminary grade and feedback on your participation at midpoint.

## **Grading Scale & Rubric**

All work will be graded on a scale of 100 points. These will be the corresponding letter grades:

93-100	Α
90-92	A-
87-89	B+
83-86	В
80-82	B-
77-79	C+
73-76	С
70-72	C-
60-69	D
Below 60	F

THE **A GRADE** means that the student has exhibited exceptional capacities and exceptional performance. The Alevel paper displays excellence in content, organization, and style. The paper presents the reader with an original and focused argument. The introduction includes a clear and compelling thesis statement. Within the body of the paper, paragraphs flow logically in sequence and present convincing evidence for the argument. The paper contains few, if any, mechanical errors. In discussions, these students are visible and obvious class leaders. Such a student contributes consistently, regularly, and enthusiastically to class discussions in a way that develops the conversation, builds on the comments of others, and is thoroughly grounded in the text under discussion. The A-level participant always has clear evidence from the text (being able to point to relevant passages and concrete details), engages everyone in the class, and addresses others' remarks as well as promoting his or her own position. These students are excellent and exceptional in their performance in every class meeting.

THE **B GRADE** signifies that the student has, for any combination of reasons, demonstrated a significantly more effective command of the material than is generally expected in the course. The B-level paper is a solid effort that does more than fulfill the minimum assignment. Instead, it shows considerable evidence of careful research, thought, and planning in its thesis/argument and overall structure. The paper is well organized and offers convincing evidence in support of its thesis. The paper contains relatively few errors in word usage or mechanics. The B-level participant has much in common with the A-level student; what differentiates the two is the degree of consistency of performance. The B student is sometimes a class leader, but not always; the B student is reliable in giving concrete evidence and details, but less specific than the A student; the B student contributes to the discussion, but does not always expand it.

THE **C GRADE** is the instructor's certification that the student has demonstrated the required mastery of the material. The C-level paper is one that is acceptable and carries out the assignment in a fairly routine manner. It may present some good ideas, but those ideas may be marred by unclear writing or poor organization. The introduction may raise a potentially interesting problem or thesis, but inadequate expression or development seriously detracts from the argument. Alternatively, the paper may be written concisely and coherently but present an insufficiently developed argument which offers only minimal engagement with the topic. Occasionally the reader is distracted by more serious errors in word usage or mechanics that may make the paper hard to read. The C-level participant gives useful and relevant ideas and opinions; however, they may not support their ideas with evidence from the text or they may not contribute very frequently. The C student only rarely engages others in the class by asking questions or furthering points. These students are not the class leaders, though they are prepared and productive members of the class. They are average in their work, doing what is required but no more.

THE **D GRADE** is given when the student's grasp of the course is minimal. Grades in this range indicate that the student has performed below the level of his/her classmates and has only marginally demonstrated an understanding of the basic and essential elements of the class. The D-level paper may relate to the assignment but shows little evidence of engaging with the topic. The paper presents only a very weak or superficial argument. Supporting evidence may be presented but it is not analyzed. At times, the reader may question the relevance of the paper to the assignment. The writing is frequently awkward, indirect and confusing. Errors in syntax and mechanics distract the reader with regularity and passages may often be hard to understand. D-level participants are physically present and may actively listen, but do not contribute with any regularity, or if they do, their contributions are vague and not carefully articulated. Their preparation and participation is never reliable and they do not make an effort to engage with others in the class.

THE **F GRADE** indicates failure to master the basic and essential elements of the class, and has performed well below that of the rest of the class. The F-level paper is unacceptable. The paper is so poorly written and/or organized that it is not possible to follow the argument. Alternatively, the paper may be adequately written but does not address the assigned topic. The F-level participant is frequently unprepared, inattentive, or absent. An F level student may also be one who makes insulting and unproductive comments or engages in other disruptive or disrespectful behavior.

# Make-up Policy

No late assignments will be accepted without an excused absence. As a general rule, I do **not** give extra credit or approve incompletes. These will be permitted ONLY IN SPECIAL CIRCUMSTANCES and with PRIOR approval. All dates and deadlines are listed in the syllabus, so you have ample opportunity to manage your time and make arrangements to complete the required assignments. If you are ill or encounter an emergency, you must email me within 24 hours of the exam or due date. If you foresee problems, please come talk to me.

## **Academic Honesty**

Each student should do all work for this course (including readings, writing, and exams) independently. Although each student is responsible for the required readings and lecture notes, I encourage you to form discussion or study groups outside of class to prepare for class and tests. Any student who engages in academic dishonesty as described in the University Bulletin will receive a zero (0) for the test/assignment and risks failing the course depending on the severity of the infraction. For information on Creighton's policy on academic integrity, please see: <a href="http://www.creighton.edu/fileadmin/user/CCAS/docs/2010">http://www.creighton.edu/fileadmin/user/CCAS/docs/2010</a> Site/Academic Honesty Policy Revision January 2012.pdf

If you feel overwhelmed or confused about any of the course requirements at any time during the semester, PLEASE come talk with me.

## **Class Cancellation Policy**

In the case of a weather emergency, I will notify you via the BlueLine2 site and CU Mail if class is cancelled. If the class has not been cancelled, you are not expected to come to class if you feel that doing so would put you in danger. If I have to cancel class for any other reason, I will notify you via CU mail and BlueLine.

## **Disruption of Normal Classroom Activities**

In the event of disruption of normal classroom activities due to a widespread medical/disease outbreak or other emergency, he format for this course may be modified to enable completion of the course. In that event, you will be provided an addendum to this syllabus that will supersede this version.

#### **Classroom Etiquette**

To create a pleasant learning environment, I encourage students to speak up and participate in lecture. The focus should be on learning and listening to both the professor and fellow students. To facilitate this, please **silence your cell phones and other mobile devices during class**. Laptops and mobile tablets are permitted in class ONLY

for note-taking purposes. Many students have said that they find it distracting to see their classmates using computers for non-course related purposes, so keep in mind that surfing the internet, facebooking, emailing, or doing other work during lectures on your laptop or phone is extremely disrespectful both to me and to your classmates (in addition to detracting from your own learning). If I find that the use of laptops/tablets is having a disruptive effect on the class, I will ban them from the classroom. If you disrupt class, you will be asked to leave and will receive a zero for participation.

#### **Americans with Disabilities Act - Statement**

If you have a disability that will require academic accommodations, you need to do both of the following as soon as possible: I. Contact the Office of Disability Accommodations located in Harper, Suite 4008 and 2. Make an appointment with your instructor to go over this letter and discuss what reasonable accommodations can be made.

#### **Course Schedule**

This schedule lays out our weekly topics and readings. All readings can be found on BlueLine or in the textbooks. Since this is a discussion class, you are required to read all assigned readings **before** the class and expect to participate actively in discussion (pop quizzes will be given is participation is poor). I will do my best to stick to this schedule, but minor adjustments may be necessary. Exam and due dates are firm.

Week I 11 Jan	Introduction Readings: Art & Crime: "Introduction," "Art Crime in Context," and Ch. 9
Week 2 16 Jan	What is Cultural Heritage? What is Art Crime and Why Does it Matter?  Readings:  Art & Crime, Ch. I, Afterword "Why Masterpieces Matter"  Loot, Introduction  Appiah, "Whose Culture Is It?" New York Review of Books 53, 2006
18 Jan	A History of Art Crime: Looting & Destruction in Antiquity Reading: Miles, Art as Plunder, Ch. I

Week 3 23 Jan	No Class
25 Jan	Art as Plunder in Late Antiqute and Medieval World Reading: Miles, Art as Plunder, Ch. 5, pp. 302-48
Week 4 30 Jan	Plunder, Collecting, Nationalism, and the Formation of Museums Readings: Dyson, "Moot Loot Speaks," in All the King's Horses Boardman, "Archaeologists, Collectors, & Museums," in Who Owns Objects?
I Feb	Filling National Museums: Plundering Egypt Reading: Loot, Part One, Chs. 1-5
Week 5 6 Feb 8 Feb	Filling National Museums: The British Museum (the Parthenon Marbles and Benin Bronzes)  Readings: Loot, Part Two, Chs. 9-11  Anderson, "An Alternative Discourse:' Local Interpreters of Antiquities in the Ottoman Empire" 2015
Week 6 13 Feb	Museums and Cultural Heritage: The Getty Readings: Loot, Part 4, Chs. 12-15
15 Feb	Exam I Research Project Topics Due (earlier submission encouraged!)
Week 7 20 Feb	Library Information Literacy Workshop: Bring your laptop to class!
22 Feb	Repatriation: The Return of Looted Artifacts  Readings: Art & Crime, Ch. 2  Brodie, N. and C. Renfrew, 2005. "Looting and the World's Archaeological Heritage: An Inadequate Response." In Annual Review of Anthropology 34: 343-61.  Gill, D. 2012. "The Material and Intellectual Consequences of Acquiring the Sarpedon Krater," in All the King's Horses.

Week 8 27 Feb I Mar	The Rape of Europa (WWII): The Monuments Men & Women  Art & War: WWII  Readings: Nichols, L. 1997. "World War II and the Displacement of Art and Cultural Property," in Spoils of War: World War II and its Aftermath.
<b>Week 9</b> 5-9 Mar	Spring Recess - No Class
Week 10 13 Mar	Art & War: WWII  Readings: Nichols, L. 1997. "World War II and the Displacement of Art and Cultural Property," in Spoils of War: World War II and its Aftermath.  Shoumatoff, 2014, "The Devil and the Art Dealer," Vanity Fair: http://www.vanityfair.com/culture/2014/04/degenerate-art-cornelius-gurlitt-munich-apartment  Eddy, 2017, "Hidden Treasures of Nazis' Art Dealer Finally Go on Display," NY Times: https://www.nytimes.com/2017/11/01/arts/design/gurlitt-nazi-art.html
15 Mar	Research Project Prospectus Due and Student topic presentations War & Cultural Heritage: The Iraq War Readings: Art & Crime, Chs. 6, 20 IS and Cultural Genocide: Antiquities Trafficking in the Terrorist State, 2016: Intro, Ch. I Brian Rose ASOR 2013 Plenary Address: <a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=uVIrPXI511Q">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=uVIrPXI511Q</a>

<b>Week I I</b> 20 Mar	War & Cultural Heritage: The Iraq War  Readings: Bogdanos, 2005. "The Casualties of War: the Truth about the Iraq Museum," AJA. Bodganos, 2005. "The Terrorist in the Art Gallery" Hamilakis, 2009, "The 'War on Terror' and the Military-Archaeology Complex: Iraq, Ethics, and Neo-Colonialism"
22 Mar	War & Cultural Heritage Today: ISIS, Syria, and more Readings: Peritz, 2014. "The Islamic State Isn't Just Killing People. It's Destroying a Culture": http://www.washingtonpost.com/opinions/islamic-state-militants-arent-just-killing-people theyre-destroying-a-culture/2014/08/22/0b11f766-1819-11e4-85b6-c1451e622637_story.html  "Decolonising Heritage in Syria: Revolution and Bosra Al-Sham" 2017  IS and Cultural Genocide: Antiquities Trafficking in the Terrorist State, 2016: Chs. 3-5  Harmanşah, 2015, "ISIS, Heritage, and the Spectacles of Destruction in the Global Media"  "Mooting the Looting" 2014 interview: http://rt.com/shows/worlds-apart-oksana-boyko/202687-ancient-artefacts-isis-economy/
Week 12 27 Mar 29 Mar	Poverty, Subsistence Digging, and the Protection of Cultural Heritage Readings: Brodie and Contreras. 2012. "The Economics of the Looted Archaeological Site of Bab edh- Dhra: A View from Google Earth," All the King's Horses. Hollowell, "Moral Arguments on Subsistence Digging"  Forgers & Fakes
	Readings: Art & Crime, Ch. 7 German, S.C. 2012. "Unprovenienced Artifacts and the Invention of Minoan and Mycenaean Religion" in All the King's Horses Hebborn, E. The Art Forger's Handbook, Introduction
Week 13 3 Apr	Art Crime: Who & Why Reading: Art & Crime, Ch. 4
5 Apr	Writing Workshop  Bring a complete printed draft of your paper to class and post digital copy online.

<b>Week 14</b> 10 Apr	Famous 20 <sup>th</sup> Century Art Crimes Readings: Art & Crime, Ch. 5
12 Apr	Exam II
<b>Week 15</b> 17-19 Apr	Student Research Presentations
<b>Week 16</b> 24 Apr 26 Apr	Student Research Presentations  Research Papers Due
	nesearch rapers Due
<b>I May</b> Tuesday I Iam	Take-Home Final Exam Due (no in-class final)

## **Useful Websites**

http://www.asor-syrianheritage.org/about/

ASOR Cultural Heritage Initiative

# http://www.archaeological.org

Official site of the Archaeological Institute of America (AIA), the professional organization of classical archaeologists.

## http://www.saa.org/

Official site of the Society for American Archaeology, the professional organization of archaeologists who study the material record of the American past.

## http://www.sha.org/

Official site of the Society for Historical Archaeology, the professional organization of archaeologists who work on cultures dating after ca. 1400 CE.

## http://www.rpanet.org

Site of the Register of Professional Archaeologists, which is "focused solely on the promotion and maintenance of professional standards in archaeology."

#### http://www.aamd.org/

Official site of the Association of Art Museum Directors, an organization formed by large-scale art museums in North America.

## http://www.savingantiquities.org/

Official site of Saving Antiquities for Everyone (SAFE), a non-profit organization founded in the wake of the National Museum of Iraq looting of 2003.

#### http://www.international.icomos.org/home.htm

Official site of the International Council on Museums and Sites, an NGO concerned with preserving sites of cultural heritage.

## http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/

The World Heritage List, created by UNESCO to denote sites of particular cultural or natural significance.

## http://whc.unesco.org/en/158/

The World Heritage in Danger list is designed to draw attention to World Heritage sites that are in danger of being destroyed.

## http://exchanges.state.gov/culprop/committee.html

Site of the President's Cultural Property Advisory Committee.

## http://lootingmatters.blogspot.com

Blog of David Gill (U. of Wales-Swansea) on archaeology and looting.

## http://www.artcrimeresearch.org/

Association for Research into Crimes Against Art

## http://art-crime.blogspot.com/

ARCA's Blog:

## http://lootingmatters.blogspot.com/

Looting Matters Blog

## http://chasingaphrodite.com/

Chasing Aphrodite

#### http://culturalpropertylaw.wordpress.com/

Cultural Property & Archaeology Law

#### http://www.drhawass.com/

Zahi Hawass' website

#### http://culturalpropertyrepat.blogspot.com/

Cultural Property & Repatriation News Issues Blog

# http://conflictantiquities.wordpress.com/

illicit antiquities trading in economic crisis, organised crime and political violence